Revision Letter

Editor: Jaehoon Paul Jeong
Date: April 29, 2021

OLD: draft-ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring-data-model-07
NEW: draft-ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring-data-model-08

Dear Tom Petch and Andy Bierman,

I sincerely appreciate your detailed comments to improve the YANG module of our I2NSF NSF Monitoring YANG Data Model Draft.
I have addressed your comments as the following. I use a bold font for your comments and use a regular font for my responses with a prefix "=> [PAUL]".

Tom Petch's Comments:
Some admin comments on -07; I think that you need to:

- change the title in YANG revision reference
=> [PAUL] We have changed the title in YANG Revision reference to follow the new title.

OLD

```
revision "2021-03-31" {
   description "Initial revision";
   reference
     "RFC XXXX: I2NSF NSF Monitoring YANG Data Model";

   // RFC Ed.: replace XXXX with an actual RFC number and remove
   // this note.
 }
```

NEW

```
revision "2021-04-29" {
   description "Latest revision";
   reference
     "RFC XXXX: I2NSF NSF Monitoring Interface YANG Data Model";

   // RFC Ed.: replace XXXX with an actual RFC number and remove
   // this note.
 }
```

- add to the I-D references
RFC959
RFC8632
=> [PAUL] RFC959 and RFC8632 have been added to the I-D references.

- shorten lines. There is a limit to line length in RFC as per the Style Guide. This is exceeded in the YANG where some of the path statements take it over 80 while some of the examples are over 100.
=> [PAUL] We have fixed the line length problem to less than 72 characters according to the RFC Style Guide. One of the fixed examples is as follows:

OLD

```
<notification xmlns="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:netconf:notification:1.0">
  <eventTime>2021-03-31T07:43:52.181088+00:00</eventTime>
  <i2nsf-event xmlns="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
    <i2nsf-system-detection-alarm>
      <alarm-category   xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-nsf-
monitoring">
        nsfmi:mem-usage-alarm
      </alarm-category>
      <acquisition-method   xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-
nsf-monitoring">
        nsfmi:subscription
      </acquisition-method>
      <emission-type    xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-nsf-
monitoring">
        nsfmi:on-change
      </emission-type>
      <dampening-type   xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-nsf-
monitoring">
        nsfmi:on-repetition
      </dampening-type>
      <usage>91</usage>
      <threshold>90</threshold>
      <message>Memory Usage Exceeded the Threshold</message>
      <nsf-name>time_based_firewall</nsf-name>
      <severity>high</severity>
    </i2nsf-system-detection-alarm>
  </i2nsf-event>
</notification>
```

NEW

```
<notification xmlns="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:netconf:notification:1.0">
  <eventTime>2021-03-31T07:43:52.181088+00:00</eventTime>
  <i2nsf-event
    xmlns="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
    <i2nsf-system-detection-alarm>
      <alarm-category
        xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:\
                     ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
        nsfmi:mem-usage-alarm
      </alarm-category>
      <acquisition-method
        xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:\
                     ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
        nsfmi:subscription
      </acquisition-method>
      <emission-type
        xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:\
                     ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
        nsfmi:on-change
      </emission-type>
      <dampening-type
        xmlns:nsfmi="urn:ietf:params:xml:ns:yang:\
                     ietf-i2nsf-nsf-monitoring">
        nsfmi:on-repetition
      </dampening-type>
```

```
      <usage>91</usage>
      <threshold>90</threshold>
      <message>Memory Usage Exceeded the Threshold</message>
      <nsf-name>time_based_firewall</nsf-name>
      <severity>high</severity>
    </i2nsf-system-detection-alarm>
  </i2nsf-event>
</notification>
```

- add a reference for the import of ietf-i2nsf-policy-rule-for-nsf

=> [PAUL] We added the reference to the import of ietf-i2nsf-policy-rule-for-nsf as the following:

OLD

```
  import ietf-i2nsf-policy-rule-for-nsf {
    prefix nsfi;
  }
```

NEW

```
  import ietf-i2nsf-policy-rule-for-nsf {
    prefix nsfi;
    reference
      "Section 4.1 of draft-ietf-i2nsf-nsf-facing-interface-dm-12";
  }
```

Andy Bierman's Comments:

I reviewed your note, the diffs and the YANG module.
I think draft-07 is ready (no issues or nits)

There are probably some clarifications needed to adapt YANG Push dampening to I2NSF. YP refers to the data nodes changing within the dampening period. In this case, the notes to implementers should be clear about any events sent at the end of the dampening period because events were suppressed (if any). There might be a different procedure for each event or sub-event.

=> [PAUL] We have added descriptions to clarify the dampening usage for the notifications.

OLD

```
  grouping dampening {
    description
      "A grouping for dampening period of notification.";
    leaf dampening-period {
      type uint32;
      units "centiseconds";
      default "0";
      description
        "Specifies the minimum interval between the assembly of
         successive update records for a single receiver of a
         subscription.  Whenever subscribed objects change and
         a dampening-period interval (which may be zero) has
         elapsed since the previous update record creation for
         a receiver, any subscribed objects and properties
```

```
        that have changed since the previous update record
        will have their current values marshalled and placed
        in a new update record.";
      reference
        "RFC 8641:  Subscription to YANG Notifications for
        Datastore Updates - Section 5.";
    }
  }
```

NEW

```
  grouping dampening {
    description
      "A grouping for dampening period of notification.";
    leaf dampening-period {
      type uint32;
      units "centiseconds";
      default "0";
      description
        "Specifies the minimum interval between the assembly of
        successive update records for a single receiver of a
        subscription. Whenever subscribed objects change and
        a dampening-period interval (which may be zero) has
        elapsed since the previous update record creation for
        a receiver, any subscribed objects and properties
        that have changed since the previous update record
        will have their current values marshalled and placed
        in a new update record. But if the subscribed objects change
        when the dampening-period is active, it should update the
        record without sending the notification until the dampening-
        period is finished. If multiple changes happen during the
        active dampening-period, it should update the record with the
        latest data. And at the end of the dampening-period, it should
        send the record as a notification with the latest updated
        record and restart the countdown.";
      reference
        "RFC 8641:  Subscription to YANG Notifications for
        Datastore Updates - Section 5.";
    }
  }
```

Thanks for your help and support.

Best Regards,
Paul
--
==========
Mr. Jaehoon (Paul) Jeong, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Department of Computer Science and Engineering
Sungkyunkwan University
Office: +82-31-299-4957
Email: jaehoon.paul@gmail.com, pauljeong@skku.edu
Personal Homepage: http://iotlab.skku.edu/people-jaehoon-jeong.php